



County Hall
Cardiff
CF10 4UW
Tel: (029) 2087 2000

Neuadd y Sir
Caerdydd
CF10 4UW
Ffôn: (029) 2087 2000

GOHEBIAETH YN DILYN CYFARFOD Y PWYLLGOR

Pwyllgor PWYLLGOR CRAFFU'R ECONOMI A DIWYLLIANT

Dyddiad ac amser y cyfarfod DYDD MAWRTH, 11 GORFFENAF 2023, 5.00 PM

Gweler isod gohebiaeth anfon gan Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor ar ôl y cyfarfod , ynghyd ag unrhyw ymatebion a gafwyd

Am unrhyw fanylion pellach, cysylltwch â scrutinyviewpoints@caerdydd.gov.uk

a Gohebiaeth yn dilyn Cyfarfod y Pwyllgor (*Tudalennau 3 - 16*)

Mae'r dudalen hon yn wag yn fwriadol

My Ref: SharePoint/E&C Library/Correspondence/July 2023

Date: 12 July 2023

Councillor Burke
Cabinet Member
Cardiff Council
County Hall
Cardiff
CF10 4UW



County Hall
Cardiff,
CF10 4UW
Tel: (029) 2087 2087

Neuadd y Sir
Caerdydd,
CF10 4UW
Ffôn: (029) 2087 2088

Public Letter

Dear Councillor Burke,

ST. DAVID'S HALL

Our thanks to you, Neil Hanratty, Chris Barnett, Ruth Cayford, Richard Crook, Donna Jones, Eirian Jones, and Kathryn Richards, as well as Scott Couzens from Bevan Brittan LLP, for attending committee to answer our questions about the proposals for St. David's Hall set out in the report to Cabinet. Members have asked that I pass on the following comments and observations.

Classical and Community Programme/ Youth

Members are pleased that the classical and community programme will be a legally binding obligation within the lease, with the Memorandum of Understanding setting out how stakeholders will work together to deliver these commitments. Members note that the programme includes the current youth programme, ensuring that this continues. Members also note that Arts Active will remain with the Council.

Essential Repairs

Members note that AMG are required to deliver the agreed Essential Repairs within 10 years and that written approval from the Council is required prior to any work commencement. Members note there is a 'keep open' clause in the lease agreement.

Refurbishment Costs

Members note the Financial Implications section of the report to Cabinet refers to refurbishment costs falling to the Council and queried what these were for; Members

note these cover costs of ensuring pianos and the organ are up to standard prior to the transfer to AMG.

Data Protection Impact Assessment

Members highlighted that a Data Protection Impact Assessment may need to be completed prior to transfer to AMG, if customer details are being transferred. Members note officers' assurance that they will explore this and will complete if required.

TUPE

Members note that AMG has committed to TUPE all existing staff, circa 37 FTE employees. Members note that AMG have indicated that a reduction in staffing numbers may be required and that they will endeavour to achieve this through redeployment and normal turnover. Members note that it was not possible to offer staff VS prior to transfer because of legal advice received.

Response to VEAT

Members note there was only one request for further information when the VEAT notice was published, but nothing was progressed beyond this.

Risks

Members sought to understand what would happen were AMG to renege on their commitments. Members note officers' views that this is unlikely, that AMG will work to ensure St. David's Hall flourishes as a commercial enterprise, resulting in the cultural offer of Cardiff being improved but that, if this did happen, the Council would use the usual mechanisms to deal with non-compliance with lease agreements. Members note that, ultimately, the Council could take the building back.

Members questioned what leverage the Council has if the acoustics were affected by works. Members note officers' responses that independent acoustics engineers would be employed to try to ensure this did not happen, that the Lease contains a clause on this, that any changes would have to have listed buildings consent but that, if this did happen, the Lease enables the Council to require AMG to make good and rectify the situation.

Minority View

Cllr Berman and Cllr Shimmin have asked that their minority view be captured in this letter, which is that they do not believe the proposals are in the long-term interests of the people of Cardiff and that they would like the Council to continue to look at alternative options, which might involve looking at reprioritising other spending and also further pursuing national funding to keep the Hall as a Council-run provision.

My thanks again to you, Scott Couzens and officers for attending Committee and answering our queries.

This letter does not contain any requests for further information or recommendations and so does not require a response.

Yours sincerely,



COUNCILLOR PETER WONG
CHAIR, ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

cc Members of the Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee
Group Leaders - Cllr Lancaster, Cllr Berman, Cllr Gibson
Gavin McArthur – Chair, Governance & Audit Committee
Neil Hanratty Chris Barnett Ruth Cayford Richard Crook
Donna Jones Eirian Jones Kathryn Richards
Scott Couzens – Bevan Brittan LLP
Mel Jackson Clair James
Claire Deguara
Chris Pyke Tim Gordon Jeremy Rhys

Mae'r dudalen hon yn wag yn fwriadol

Date: 12 July 2023



County Hall
Cardiff,
CF10 4UW
Tel: (029) 2087 2087

Neuadd y Sir
Caerdydd,
CF10 4UW
Ffôn: (029) 2087 2088

Councillor Thomas
Leader,
Cardiff Council
County Hall
Cardiff
CF10 4UW

Public Letter

Dear Councillor Thomas,

ATLANTIC WHARF UPDATE

Members have asked that I pass on their thanks to you, Neil Hanratty, Chris Lee, Chris Barnett, Richard Cook, Kyle Godfrey, Eirian Jones, and Scott Couzens, Bevan Brittan LLP, for attending our meeting for pre-decision scrutiny of the report to Cabinet titled '*Atlantic Wharf Update*'. Members have asked that I pass on the following comments and observations on the public information; I have sent a separate confidential letter capturing our comments on the exempt information.

Changes to Indoor Arena

Members note inflationary pressures have led Live Nation to redesign the Arena to mitigate these and ensuing risks. Members note the capacity of the Arena is staying at 15,000 and that the redesign has focused on simplifying the interior design, from a technical perspective, and reducing the interior with a single bowl. Members are pleased to note the quality of design and finish will remain high.

Transport

Members explored transport links to Atlantic Wharf and note:

- UK Government Levelling Up funding has been awarded to provide enhanced Metro linkages from Cardiff Central to Cardiff Bay, including stops at Bute Street and Pierhead Street
- The Council is contractually obligated to provide a number of car parking spaces, which it is currently proposing are provided via a Multi-Storey Car Park (MSCP)

- The MSCP and proposed active and public transport provision will assist in alleviating local residents' concerns regarding parking issues
- There may be an opportunity to have a Traffic Management Zone to tackle non-resident access and parking; this will be explored as the scheme progresses
- Masterplanning and Planning Development Control will be used to address transport issues and the level of parking provision for premises, in line with Cardiff Council's wider transport policies.

Cost to the Council

Members note the Affordability Envelope for the Council's overall contribution to the Indoor Arena is £27million. Members are aware of pressures on the Council's budget overall and note the following points made by yourself and officers in response to questions as to whether this project is still affordable given other pressures:

- The Affordability Envelope will not increase and has been factored into the Council's capital and revenue budgets, meaning it has been judged to be affordable whilst meeting other agreed commitments, such as increased funding for schools in Cardiff
- As the Affordability Envelope is not being increased, there are no additional, unexpected revenue impacts – the revenue impact of borrowing for the Affordability Envelope has already been factored into the Council's Medium Term Financial Plan
- The Indoor Arena project is leveraging in significant levels of private sector investment (over £100m) into Cardiff and into culture; this is a vote of confidence in Cardiff and will provide jobs and training for residents and economic growth.
- The Indoor Arena will provide lease payments to the Council and will ultimately revert to the Council at the end of the lease.

Delay

Members note the following risks highlighted in the meeting, were the Council to delay the Indoor Arena project:

- Risk losing the private sector investment
- Risk increasing the costs to the Council

- Risk impacts on other related projects, such as the wider Atlantic Wharf regeneration
- Risk having to pay abortive costs, detailed in Confidential Appendix 9.

Funding Strategy

Members note officers are working with treasury and financial advisors to explore funding strategies that take account of interest rate fluctuations, exploring different levers and mechanisms, the timing of these and opportunities to offset borrowing costs. Members note it is likely that a hybrid strategy will be utilised and that proposals will be brought to a future Cabinet meeting.

Thanks again to you, Scott Couzens, and all officers for attending and answering our queries. This letter does not contain any requests for further information or recommendations and so does not require a response.

Yours sincerely,

P Wong

**COUNCILLOR PETER WONG
CHAIR, ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE**

cc Members of the Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee
Group Leaders - Cllr Lancaster, Cllr Berman, Cllr Gibson
Gavin McArthur – Chair, Governance & Audit Committee
Neil Hanratty Chris Lee Chris Barnett Richard Crook
Kyle Godfrey Eirian Jones
Scott Couzens – Bevan Brittan LLP
Cabinet Support Office
Chris Pyke Tim Gordon Jeremy Rhys

Mae'r dudalen hon yn wag yn fwriadol



Date: 12 July 2023

Councillor Thomas
Leader,
Cardiff Council
County Hall
Cardiff
CF10 4UW

Public Letter

Dear Councillor Thomas,

INTERNATIONAL SPORTS VILLAGE (ISV)

Our thanks to you, Neil Hanratty, Chris Barnett, Richard Cook, Eirian Jones, and Jo-Anne Phillips for attending our meeting for pre-decision scrutiny of the report to Cabinet titled '*International Sports Village Development*'. Members have asked that I pass on the following comments and observations on the public information; I have sent a separate confidential letter capturing our comments on the exempt information.

Developer Partner

Members note that the name of the developer partner has been released into the public domain via a press release and therefore it is appropriate for their name to be included in the public section of the report to Cabinet, for transparency. Members note there was overall agreement with this point.

Transport Hub

Members note that point 23 of the report to Cabinet sets out the work underway to improve public and active transport provision for the ISV, and for there to be a park and ride solution as part of the Transport Hub to optimise connectivity to the city centre and Mermaid Quay.

Car Parking

Members note the Council is obliged by previous development agreements to provide 800 car parking spaces, that work is ongoing to develop options for provision and that there will be a further report to Cabinet on this in the future. Members note this will help to address residents concerns about non-resident parking.

Water's Edge

Members note the report to Cabinet sets out that there will be a promenade of 8 metres around the water's edge, apart from the Cardiff Bay Yacht Club site, to enable public access to the water's edge and that there is confidence in this as a minimum, as it is not possible to build on this land due to the revetment wall and tie-backs.

Members note that previously Committee had been informed the promenade would be 15-19 metres and would enable walking and cycling. Members note officers' explanation that these plans are still contained in the masterplan, which has not altered, and that the masterplan will form the basis of the planning application submitted by the developer.

Greening the Site

Members asked whether it was possible to make the site more visually green and note officers' responses that:

- The remediated nature of the site makes some planting difficult
- Parks officers are working on possible solutions, including trees in containers, with a view to planting into the ground where this is possible
- The intention is that the site will be as visually green as possible and landscaped to a very high level.

Heat Exchange

Members note the proposed heat exchange system varies significantly from older heat exchange systems used in housing, such as on the Penrhys housing estate, and that the proposed system will not lead to some areas being too hot and some being too cold.

Length of Papers

Members appreciate the timing of reports to Cabinet, and therefore to scrutiny, particularly of projects as complex as Atlantic Wharf and ISV, is difficult and that, ideally, these reports would be staggered to ensure a manageable volume of information. Members are pleased that at Committee you referenced this and acknowledged that it was not ideal. Members agree: it is not conducive to good scrutiny for Members to have circa 700 pages of detailed information to read and process in 6 days. Therefore, Members **request** that officers are mindful of this in future and that steps are taken to try to mitigate this, where possible, recognising that this may not always be possible.

This letter requires a response, please, to the following:

Request:

- Members **request** that officers are mindful of the need to stagger reports to Cabinet where possible to ensure a manageable volume of information to enable good scrutiny.

Yours sincerely,

P Wong

**COUNCILLOR PETER WONG
CHAIR, ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE**

cc Members of the Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee
Group Leaders - Cllr Lancaster, Cllr Berman, Cllr Gibson
Gavin McArthur – Chair, Governance & Audit Committee
Neil Hanratty Chris Barnett Richard Crook
Eirian Jones Jo Anne Phillips
Debi Said Clair James
Claire Deguara
Chris Pyke Tim Gordon Jeremy Rhys

Mae'r dudalen hon yn wag yn fwriadol

**SWYDDFA'R ARWEINYDD
OFFICE OF THE LEADER**

Fy Nghyf / My Ref: CM50058

Dyddiad / Date: 13 July 2023



Caerdydd,
CF10 4UW
Ffôn: (029) 2087 2088
www.caerdydd.gov.uk
County Hall
Cardiff,
CF10 4UW
Tel: (029) 2087 2087
www.cardiff.gov.uk

Councillor Peter Wong
Chair, Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee
Cardiff Council
Atlantic Wharf
Cardiff

Via email: A.Holt@cardiff.gov.uk

Annwyl/Dear Peter,

RE: Response to the Public Letter relating to the International Sports Village Report

Thank you for your letter and for the opportunity to discuss the latest update on the International Sports Village.

I note the comments in your letter and the request for officers to stagger reports to Cabinet to allow a manageable volume of work to enable good scrutiny.

I understand the sentiment of this request but unfortunately the pace of decision making is often driven by commercial imperatives and no doubt that will continue to be the case. Of course, if there is opportunity to stagger reports, I am sure officers will do so, not least because the time and effort required to prepare a report is substantially greater than any time required to undertake good scrutiny.

Yn gywir,
Yours sincerely,

**CYNGHORYDD / COUNCILLOR HUW THOMAS
ARWEINYDD / LEADER
CYNGOR CAERDYDD / CARDIFF COUNCIL**

GWEITHIO DROS GAERDYDD, GWEITHIO DROSOCH CHI

Mae'r Cyngor yn croesawu gohebiaeth yn Gymraeg, Saesneg neu'n ddwyieithog. Byddwn yn cyfathrebu â chi yn ôl eich dewis, dim ond i chi roi gwybod i ni pa un sydd well gennych. Ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi.

WORKING FOR CARDIFF, WORKING FOR YOU

The Council welcomes correspondence in Welsh, English or bilingually. We will ensure that we communicate with you in the language of your choice, as long as you let us know which you prefer. Corresponding in Welsh will not lead to delay.



Mae'r dudalen hon yn wag yn fwriadol